

DRAFT MINUTES



Ambient Air Quality Objectives Team Meeting #1

Date: 13 March 2017

Time: 09:30 – 3:00 PM

Place: CASA, 10th Floor, 10035 108 ST NW, Edmonton, AB T5J 3E1

IN ATTENDANCE

Name	Stakeholder Organization
Randy Angle	Prairie Acid Rain Coalition
Atta Atia	Alberta Agriculture and Forestry
Laura Blair	Alberta Environment and Parks
Laurie Cheperdak	Alberta Environment and Parks
Matthew Dance	Clean Air Strategic Alliance
Keith Denman (for agenda items 1&2)	Clean Air Strategic Alliance
Long Fu	Alberta Environment and Parks
Rob Hoffman	Canadian Fuels
Alison Miller	Imperial Oil Ltd. (CAPP/CIAC)
Steven Probert	Alberta Health Services
Lynn Que	Alberta Health Services
David Spink	Prairie Acid Rain Coalition
Lindsay Smith-Munoz	Alberta Health
Joe Vipond (by phone)	Alberta Environment Network
Darcy Walberg	North West Refinery
Nina Wang	Alberta Health
Kevin Warren (by phone)	Alberta Airsheds Council

REGRETS

Sanjay Prasad	Alberta Airsheds Council
Opel Vuzi	Health Canada



ACTION ITEMS

ACTION	Who	When
1.1: Forward the AEP AAQO Statement of Opportunity to the team.	Matt	27 March
1.2: Create a table comparing the AAQO substances under review with their CAAQS counterpart.	Matt	June meeting
1.3: Create a library of documents organized by substance and author.	Matt / CASA	27 March
1.4: Create a draft terms of reference for discussion at the next AAQO meeting in June.	Matt	27 March
1.5: David will ask the CASA Board to consider appointing additional stakeholder representatives to the AAQO Team, as outlined.	David	15 March 2017
1.6: Contact those stakeholders not represented on the CASA Board to ask for their involvement with the AAQO team.	Matt	27 March
1.7: Contact each sub-group and organize a half day face-to-face meeting.	Matt	Week of 27 March
1.8: Laurie will complete work on the substance comparison chart and forward to the team (via Matt if needed).	Laurie	By June meeting
1.9: Forward the equivalency calculations for a CAAQS substance limits to AAQO to the team.	AEP	By June meeting
1.10: Poll for team and sub-group meeting dates.	Matt	27 March

Meeting Objectives:

1. To convene the first meeting of the AAQO team;
2. To review the CASA Process;
3. To receive background information on previous objective setting process, and;
4. Start work on a terms of reference and work plan.

1. Administration

Team members were welcomed to CASA and the first meeting of the AAQO Team. There was a round table of introductions where team members described their respective stakeholder organizations, and their interest in the project.

The meeting objectives and agenda were reviewed, and the following additions were made to the agenda under item 6. Next Steps:

- a. Co-chair selection, and
- b. CASA Board update from the AAQO Project Team.

The meeting objectives and revised agenda were approved by consensus.



2. CASA Overview – CASA Secretariat Roles and Responsibilities

Keith Denman, CASA's Executive Director, presented on the CASA process, including the responsibilities of stakeholders to the process and CASA's responsibility to stakeholders; critical elements and outcomes associated with success were also described.

The following represent the main points from Keith's presentation:

- The CASA process is multi-stakeholder with representatives from
 - Government, Industry, ENGOs, and Airsheds
- Focus is on air quality policy development
- Structured, facilitated process
 - Consensus based decision making
 - Interest-based negotiating
- Good track record of recommendations being implemented by government
- Effective work needs clarity on the issue being discussed and on what the alternative to an agreement would be
- CASA is most effective where:
 - There is clarity on desired outcome but flexibility on how to achieve them
 - Appropriate amount of time and resources for the work
 - More than one factor in play: i.e. many substances under consideration, time, stringency, etc.
 - Stakeholders are willing to participate in good faith
 - Political folks stand by the process and the outcomes

Discussion

There is a wide range of experience with the CASA process around the table. That range of experience is reflected in the following comments made by some of Team members regarding their understanding, experience and concerns with the CASA process:

- It is important to slow down and really understand with other people are saying. This involves good listening, and asking 'stupid' questions.
- It's very important to maintain an open mind and to explore options that may not seem worthwhile on the surface.
- Consensus does not mean 'no', but rather explaining why something cannot be agreed to, and what the alternatives might be.
- A concern was expressed for certain groups or individuals destroying the process.
 - While CASA cannot prevent individuals from 'going around' the process and, for instance, speaking directly to their MLA or Minister, CASA does require that all stakeholders act in good faith, in an open and direct manner.
 - Everyone around the table agreed to the principle of participation in good faith.

3. Background Presentation and Discussion

Laura Blair presented on the background of the AAQO Team.

- CASA held a priority setting workshops where stakeholders provided ideas and advice (using the CASA Process) on a short list of substances that AEP should consider for AAQO



review/revision/development. The first priority setting workshop occurred in 2001, with additional priority setting workshops in 2004 and 2009.

- After the priority setting process AEP worked with a Stakeholder Advisory Committee (SAC) on the actual review and setting or revising AAQOs. This SAC process was sunsetted in December 2015.
- This round of priority setting involves the following substances:
 - PM_{2.5}, O₃, SO₂, NO₂, H₂S and TRS.
- The priorities for this work plan are based on ensuring that the AAQO and the current and planned Canadian Ambient Air Quality Standards (CAAQS) (PM_{2.5}, O₃, SO₂ and NO₂) are complementary and there are no inconsistencies between the two. It was noted that the CAAQS and AAQOs are intended to serve different purposes and are different in nature but they need to work together. CAAQS have been developed for long-term air zone management while AAQOs cover averaging periods ranging from 1 hour to 1 year. Alberta therefore has to review their current ambient air quality objectives for CAAQS parameters in light of recent CAAQS changes. H₂S and TRS are carry forward substances from the previous work plan.

The AAQO Team has been asked to:

- Review the science, including health, emissions, requirements in other jurisdictions and monitoring technology
- Look at monitoring data
- Evaluate AAQO averaging times and levels based on the available info
- Bring forward additional relevant science information
- Identify risks
- Assess causal relationship and risk exposure
- Propose ambient air quality objectives for PM_{2.5}, O₃, SO₂, NO₂, H₂S and TRS after careful review and consideration of the information

Consensus

The CASA process stipulates that non-consensus items be presented, as a fallback position, to the CASA Board for review. Stakeholders who hold the non-consensus view of a recommendation must provide a rationale for their view and alternatives for the CASA Board to consider.

This project team will have a different fallback position. In the event of a non-consensus outcome, stakeholders will outline their non-consensus views of a recommended objective, and AEP will make the decision on how to proceed.

Discussion

The following points were made in discussion:

- In December 2016 the CASA Board accepted a statement of opportunity from AEP for CASA to facilitate the stakeholder engagement element of its AAQO review and development.
- It is expected that this round of priority setting will take 3 years to complete (2017 – 2020).

- The Canadian Ambient Air Quality Standards differ from the AEP Ambient Objectives in their time period measurements.
- In the past, AEP has seen 25 new, revised or adopted standards agreed to by consensus. However, there has not been agreement on ammonia, and it is currently sitting with AEP Executive.
- It was noted that some members may have difficulty accessing a third party document sharing tools (such as Drop Box), and that CASA should endeavor to load all documents to their website library.

ACTION 1.1: Matthew will forward the AEP AAQO Statement of Opportunity to the team.

ACTION 1.2: Matthew will create a table comparing the AAQO substances under review with their CAAQS counterpart.

ACTION 1.3: CASA will create a library of documents organized by substance and author.

4. Terms of Reference

The following items were identified as being necessary for a robust terms of reference during a facilitated team discussion:

Background

The December 2016 Board Decision
AEP Context
Timeline for completion of work and the next review

Outcome

The CASA Ambient Air Quality Objective Team will recommend to Alberta Environment and Parks consensus recommendations for new, revised or reconfirmed PM_{2.5}, O₃, SO₂, NO₂, H₂S and TRS AAQOs. The team will also provide a rationale for proposed ambient air quality objectives that consider the current science including but not limited to ecosystem and human health, emissions, actions in other jurisdictions and monitoring technology and monitoring data.

Roles and Responsibilities

Describe the various roles and responsibilities as per other CASA terms of reference.

If the stakeholders determine that addition expertise is required, they are welcome to query colleagues from within their stakeholder organizations to develop a detailed and focused question or task that a consultant can be hired to address. As CASA does not have an external budget for this team, and additional funding (i.e. to hire a consultant) must be raised by stakeholders.

Fallback

Describe the AEP fallback position.

Timeline and scope



Describe the ‘what’ and ‘when’ of the project.

Quorum

The following quorum was defined by the project team, and will be used as a requirement for each meeting:

Organization	Number of stakeholders to achieve quorum
Alberta Airshed Council	1
Alberta Environment and Parks	1
Alberta Health	1
Alberta Health Services	1
Environmental Non-Governmental Organizations	1
Industry	1

ACTION 1.4: Matt will take this discussion and create a draft terms of reference for discussion at the next AAQO meeting in June.

Additional membership

The team discussed additional stakeholders who should be invited to the AAQO team:

Health Canada:

Environment Canada: Martin Van Olst, Rachael Mintz

Chemical Industry: Greg Moffatt

Electrical Industry: Jim Hackett, Ahmed Idriss

Forestry (Weyerhaeuser) : Brian Gilliland

Alberta Forest Products Association Industry: Keith Murray

Transportation Government:

Transportation Industry: AMTA, Andrew Barns

Agricultural Industry: Rich Smith, Clyde Graham Canadian Fertilizer Institute

First Nations, Metis and Inuit: Health Canada group – Opel Vuzi, Wadieh Yacoub (Medical Officer of Health), Simon Sahudah.

Support resources

As discussed previously, additional resources and information can be sought through the stakeholder organizations represented at this table. Additional relevant information may be brought forward from other process that team members are involved in. To facilitate this sharing of information, a standing agenda item ‘Updates’ will be included on all AAQO Team agendas.

Specific processes that can be included in the ‘Updates’ section of each agenda can include:



- Odour management
- IAEMP – Industrial Air Emissions Management Program
- CAAQS
- Air Zone particulate matter/ozone management plans
- Air Quality Management Frameworks
- Acid Deposition
- Implementation of the AER/Alberta Health Recurrent Human Health Complaint Report – Fort McKay. Hereafter referred to as the “Fort McKay Report” which is possibly relevant to H₂S and TRS objective setting.

ACTION 1.5: David will ask the CASA Board to consider appointing additional stakeholder representatives to the AAQO Team, as outlined.

ACTION 1.6: Matt will contact those stakeholders not represented on the CASA Board to ask for their involvement with the AAQO team.

5. Work plan

With regard to a work plan, the AAQO Team discussed the order of work on the substances and the need for subgroups and how those subgroups should work. The discussion reflected many ideas, from a number of subgroup working concurrently to one subgroup working on one substance at a time.

To help with the timing discussion, it was agreed that the following subgroups would be formed:

Substance	Membership	Research
PM _{2.5} and O ₃	Joe, Laurie*, Laura, Atta, Alberta Health Services, Rob, Kevin	CAAQS Equivalent Assessment. Other relevant information.
H ₂ S and TRS	David*, Alberta Health, Industry (TBD), Sanjay, Laura, Alison	Ft. McKay report, WHO report, Health and Wellness Report, Monitoring data.
NO ₂ and SO ₂	Randy, Darcy, Industry (TBD), Laura*, Alberta Health.	CAAQS Science Report, CAAQS Equivalent Assessment, Other methods, SO ₂ only ‘threshold’ limit.

*The contact for each sub-group to help Matt organize meetings.

Goal: To scan and make available to the team relevant ecosystem and human health information for each group of substances. Based on this information, each sub-group will also outline a ‘plan’ for each substance on how it could be approached and assessed. The outcome of each sub-groups scan will inform the team’s work plan and be brought to the next team meeting for discussion.

Discussion:

- Materials should be placed and organized substance on the CASA Member area of casahome.org.

- Laurie is constructing a chart with current thresholds and health outcomes at a variety of exposure levels. This chart is based on the current literature.
- Laura has already started gathering some documents. These will be forwarded to Matt.
- Andrew Clayton of AEP is currently working on a method that identifies an objective number that if that objective is met the CAAQS should not be exceeded.
- When we get beyond the sub-group assessment task, the AAQO should consider a broader assessment of each substance e.g. socio-economic metrics.
- It was noted that Alberta Health has a preference to start with H₂S, and Alberta Environment and Parks with PM_{2.5}. These two may be able to run in parallel.

ACTION 1.7: Matt will contact each sub-group and organize a half day face-to-face meeting.

ACTION 1.8: Laurie will complete work on the substance comparison chart and forward to the team (via Matt if needed).

ACTION 1.9: AEP will forward the AAQO/CAAQS calculations to the team.

6. Next Steps

The following points were raised as next steps:

1. We need to select co-chairs for this team. Laura Blair will act as the government co-chair, and we need at least one other co-chair from Industry and ENGOs. This will be discussed at the next meeting.
2. David will provide a verbal update to the CASA Board at their March 15th meeting.
3. Matt will poll for a team meeting date in early June and will also poll for sub-group meeting dates after consulting with the contact for each sub-group.

ACTION 1.10: Matt will poll for subgroup and team meeting dates.

7. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 3PM.