

# Minutes



## Performance Measures Committee meeting #64

Date: 17 January 2013

Time: 9:00 am – 11:00 am

Place: Teleconference

### In attendance:

Name	Stakeholder group
Crystal Parrell	Alberta Environment and Water
Ruth Yanor	Mewassin Community Council
Celeste Dempster	CASA

### With regrets:

Name	Stakeholder group
Peter Darbyshire	Graymont Inc.

The meeting began at 9:15 am. Quorum was not achieved.

### Action Items:

Action items	Who	Due
63.2: Celeste will investigate the origins of the definitions of administrative, operational and substantive that are used in the calculation of Performance Measure #3 for discussion at the next meeting.	Celeste	In progress. Carry forward.
64.1: Celeste will follow-up with Peter on all the discussions from today's meeting to achieve quorum.	Celeste	ASAP.
64.2: Celeste will follow-up on the Data Issues Group recommendation 5-10 to obtain more information on the intent of this recommendation.	Celeste	In time for next reporting cycle of the low-rated recommendation matrix.
64.3: Celeste will follow-up on the Data Issues Group recommendation 6-8 to obtain more information on the intent of this recommendation, how it was envisioned it could be implemented and what would subsequently be done with the information.	Celeste	In time for next reporting cycle of the low-rated recommendation matrix.
64.4: Celeste will contact the Co-Chairs of the 2005 Renewable and Alternative Energy Project Team to get more information on how this recommendation could be met.	Celeste	In time for next reporting cycle of the low-rated recommendation matrix.
64.5: Celeste will prepare a first draft of the 2012 annual report and send it to the Committee for review.	Celeste	25 January 2013.

## 1) Administrative Items

*Action Item 64.1: Celeste will follow-up with Peter on all the discussions from today's meeting to achieve quorum.*

The Agenda and Meeting Objectives were approved.

The minutes from meeting #63 were approved.

Action items from meeting #63 were reviewed as follows:

<b>Action items</b>	<b>Who</b>	<b>Status</b>
62.1: Celeste will investigate the current system that is in place to track recommendations and ensure follow-up.	Celeste	Completed. See update below.
62.5: Celeste will contact the Co-Chairs to follow-up on recommendation 8-1 from the 2003 Data Issues Group.	Celeste	Completed. The results were added to the low-rated recommendations matrix.
63.1: Celeste will administer the 'Recommendation Implementation Assessment Questionnaire' for the two recommendations that were identified as substantive from 2008.	Celeste	Completed. The results will be reviewed today under Performance Measure 3.
63.2: Celeste will investigate the origins of the definitions of administrative, operational and substantive that are used in the calculation of Performance Measure #3 for discussion at the next meeting.	Celeste	In progress. Carry forward.
63.3: Celeste will poll for dates for a meeting in January 2013.	Celeste	Completed.

Action Item 62.1: Celeste investigated the current system that is in place at CASA to track recommendations and found that there was no comprehensive system beyond the records kept by the PMC project manager. The CASA Secretariat has hired a consultant to put together a proposal for a database that would track not only recommendation implementation but also CASA Board and Executive Committee decisions and important team milestones. This database will also be searchable. As this work continues to develop Celeste will provide updates to the PMC.

## 2) Performance Measure #3

The Committee reviewed the results of PM3. There were two substantive recommendations to be reviewed. The procedure calls for the recommendations to be rated by the implementers using the Recommendation Implementation Assessment Questionnaire. For both recommendations the implementers were the Intensive Livestock Working Group, Alberta Agriculture and Rural Development and the Natural Resource Conservation Board. The three ratings were averaged for each recommendation. The result is an overall implementation rating of 90% for the year 2008.

There are no recommendations to be placed in the low-rated recommendations matrix. These results will be included in the 2012 PMC annual report to the CASA Board.

### 3) Performance Measure #5

The Committee reviewed the results of PM5. There are two graphs which show the return visits to the CASA website and the number of news stories about CASA in the Alberta news media. The quality of news stories is described qualitatively. In the past, this was represented graphically as a percentage. Since the last reporting period, CASA no longer has the software to calculate this item. Since this measure will not be used going forward in the new Performance Measurement Strategy, it was agreed that the qualitative description would suffice. These results will be included in the 2012 PMC annual report to the CASA Board.

### 4) Low-rated Recommendations

The Committee reviewed the status updates for each of the items in the low-rated recommendations matrix. The Committee made recommendations to the Board on the low-rated recommendations as described in the table below. These recommendations will be included in the 2012 PMC annual report to the CASA Board.

Recommendation	Original Rating	Recommendation from PMC
1998		
<i>Flaring and Venting Team</i>		
<p>30. The Energy and Utilities Board, Alberta Environmental Protection, Alberta Health and Alberta Agriculture, Food and Rural Development establish processes and linkages to relate data on oil and gas wells, and solution gas flaring and venting with data on pollutants, environmental receptors, and human and animal health.</p>	3	<p><u>Recommendation</u>: Send to HAHT for consideration under their mandate.</p> <p><u>Reason</u>: Seems relevant to the HAHT's Terms of Reference.</p> <p>The PMC obtained an update from Alberta Health and AARD:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-The Community Exposure and Health Effects Assessment Programs (CEHEAPs) is used to collect information from communities close to oil and gas operations.</li> <li>-AARD co-funded the Western Interprovincial Scientific Studies Association (WISSA) which investigated links between animal health effects associated with exposure to emissions from oil and natural gas field facilities.</li> <li>-AARD has the Alberta Veterinary Surveillance Network (AVSN) which allows veterinarians to report disease and non-disease related data including oil and gas exposures on a real-time basis via the internet.</li> </ul>

		<p>This update was shared with CASA’s Human and Animal Health Team (HAHT) to help assess recommendation implementation. The team’s reviews were mixed – some felt the recommendation had been satisfied while others felt more work was required because:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-CEHEAPs is a limited data grab of one week’s duration and is further constrained by gathering data on healthy individuals between the ages of 18 and 65.</li> </ul> <p>The HAHT is currently reviewing the implementation of all Human Health Team, Animal Health Team, and HAHT recommendations. This includes a review of the Comprehensive Human Health Monitoring System (CHHMS) – an original recommendation from the HAHT team – which the team originally thought would be covered off by the Alberta Real Time Syndromic Surveillance Network (ARTSSN). Based on the most recent update on ARTSSN, this is not the case as ARTSSN does not fulfill all the original goals of the CHHMS. The HAHT is currently working to determine the best path forward to advance progress on this work.</p>
<p>36. Alberta Health develop methods and, if feasible, implement a program for measuring personal exposure to compounds of concern emitted by flares and interpret the results.</p>	3	<p><u>Recommendation:</u> Close.</p> <p><u>Reason:</u> Complete.</p> <p>The PMC obtained an update from Alberta Health which was shared with the HAHT to help assess recommendation implementation. The HAHT reviewed the update and determined that the recommendation has been satisfied.</p>
2002		
<b><i>Acidifying Emissions Management Implementation Team</i></b>		
<p>3. Alberta Environment should lead an evaluation of the acidifying emissions management system every two to three years based on the evaluation process that has been established by AEMIT. Evaluation results should be reported to</p>	0	<p><u>Recommendation:</u> Reassess.</p> <p><u>Reason:</u> Implementation differs from wording in recommendation.</p> <p>Alberta Environment and Sustainable</p>

<p>the CASA Board and the next evaluation should be done in 2003. This task would require Alberta Environment to complete the forms that AEMIT has developed and used to conduct its evaluation; these are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• the goals, objectives and performance measures table, and</li> <li>• the evaluation protocols table.</li> </ul>		<p>Resource Development completed the 2004 review and are currently conducting the 2009 assessment. A five-year interval was used to correspond with new emissions data. However, the evaluation did not use the forms developed by the AEMIT. A former co-chair was available for comment and felt that to fulfill the intent of this recommendation, the evaluation forms of Appendix C-2 and the performance measures of C-3 need to be completed.</p>
2003		
<b><i>Animal Health Team</i></b>		
<p>4. The AHPT recommends that research be encouraged, supported and funded by the Alberta Government in the following areas:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Chemistry, toxicity, interaction and cumulative effects of mixtures of pollutants.</li> <li>• Effects of air pollution on reproduction and immunology.</li> <li>• Identification of biomarkers.</li> <li>• Exposure level assessment.</li> </ul>	3	<p><u>Recommendation:</u> Close.</p> <p><u>Reason:</u> Complete.</p> <p>The HAHT reviewed this recommendation and agreed that it should be considered complete.</p>
<b><i>Data Issues Group</i></b>		
<p>8-1 Approve and implement the human health monitoring framework (tool for detecting trends and associations between air quality and health-related variables).</p>	3	<p><u>Recommendation:</u> Send to HAHT for consideration under their mandate.</p> <p><u>Reason:</u> This earlier recommendation seems related to the HAHT's Terms of Reference.</p> <p>The former co-chairs of the DIG agreed with an update from Alberta Health that this recommendation would be covered off by ARTSSN – if ARTSSN was implemented as described.</p> <p>When the ARTSSN pilot project was originally suggested to the HAHT, it was felt that ARTSSN had the potential to fulfill the goals of the Comprehensive Human Health Monitoring System (CHHMS) – an original recommendation from the HAHT. Based on the most recent update on ARTSSN, this is not the case as ARTSSN does not fulfill all</p>

		the original goals of the CHHMS. The HAHT is currently working to determine the best path forward to advance progress on this work.
--	--	---

The Committee found that the following recommendations require continued tracking as implementation progresses:

- 2003, Animal Health Team, Recommendation 2:
  - The CASA Human and Animal Health Team will be considering this recommendation and following up as they move forward with their work.
- 2003, PM and Ozone Project Team, Recommendation 10c:
  - The research paper by Environment Canada has been accepted for publication and the PMC will wait until it has been published before putting a recommendation before the Board.
- 2007, Renewable and Alternative Energy Project Team, Recommendation 1:
  - It is expected that the framework will be ready to go before the Minister in fall 2013.

The Committee found that they required more information on some items in order to make a recommendation to the Board.

***Action Item 64.2: Celeste will follow-up on the Data Issues Group recommendation 5-10 to obtain more information on the intent of this recommendation.***

***Action Item 64.3: Celeste will follow-up on the Data Issues Group recommendation 6-8 to obtain more information on the intent of this recommendation, how it was envisioned it could be implemented and what would subsequently be done with the information.***

***Action Item 64.4: Celeste will contact the Co-Chairs of the 2005 Renewable and Alternative Energy Project Team to get more information on how this recommendation could be met.***

## **5) Preparations for March Board Meeting**

Ruth Yanor volunteered to give the presentation at the March Board meeting.

The Committee discussed the schedule to prepare the 2012 PMC annual report. Celeste will prepare a first draft of the 2012 annual report and send it to the Committee for review in about one week. The Committee will review the document and then Celeste will put together a second draft, if required, for final approval by the Committee no later than the end of February.

***Action Item 64.5: Celeste will prepare a first draft of the 2012 annual report and send it to the Committee for review.***

The meeting adjourned at 10:35am.