

Minutes



Human and Animal Health Implementation Team Meeting #22

Date: Tuesday, November 5th, 2013

Time: 12:00pm to 3:00pm

Place: CASA Office, Edmonton

In attendance:

Name	Stakeholder group
Joe Kendall	Alberta Agriculture, Food and Rural Development
Leigh Allard	Alberta Lung Association
Merry Turtiak	Alberta Health
Marilyn Craig	Alberta Energy Regulator
Opel Vuzi	Health Canada
Al Schulz (by phone)	Chemistry Industry Association of Canada
Laurie Cheperdak	Alberta Environment and Sustainable Resource Development
Ruth Yanor	Mewassin Community Council
Robyn Jacobsen	CASA
Michelle Riopel	CASA

Absent

Name	Stakeholder group
Long Fu	Alberta Environmental Monitoring, Evaluation, and Reporting Agency
Dawn Friesen	Alberta Health and Wellness
Brenda Woo	Health Canada
Ila Johnston	Parkland Airshed Management Zone
Judy Huntley	Bert Riggall Environmental Foundation

Action Items:

Action items	Who	Due
22.1: Provide website addresses for the GoA Open Data Portal, Alberta Health Interactive Health Data Application, Air Quality Health Index (Technical Map), and the Air Quality Health Index.	Merry	ASAP
22.2: Update 2007 report to reflect the discussions of the March 2008 Board meeting.	Secretariat	ASAP

The meeting convened 9:00 am. Quorum was achieved.

1) Administration

a. Review meeting objectives and approve agenda

- The meeting agenda and objectives were approved by consensus.

- Some changes were suggested to the Meeting #21 minutes. With these changes, the minutes were approved.

b. Review Action Items from Meeting #21

Action items	Who	Due
20.2: Forward studies done by the Lung Association to Robyn. - Studies are in pre-reader for the NPS.	Leigh	Done
21.1: Prepare rationale for each incomplete recommendation related to the implementation of the CHHMS for the team's review at their next meeting.	Merry	Done

2) Outstanding Recommendations

The team reviewed the outstanding recommendations and made a determination about each one, to be forwarded to the CASA Board of Directors.

Ref. #	Recommendation	Status
Human Health Project Team – Human Health Monitoring Framework (May 1999)		
1	Ongoing Activity: AHW to establish a system to manage and monitor the established data base with its six components on an ongoing basis as described in the CHHMS. The data base is reviewed on an ongoing basis to provide an early warning of health effects due to emissions, or links between emissions and human health symptoms or effects, and determine the health status of the population. This will require the cooperation of AENV, RHAs and CASA.	Complete. No longer relevant.
2	Issues/Actions Identification: AHW to establish a formal process to review human health issues identified through Ongoing Activity under 23 above as described in the CHHMS. A scientific advisory committee (SAC) will be needed to provide scientific oversight on this and subsequent steps.	Complete. No longer relevant.
3	Investigation: AHW, with the assistance of AAENV, EUB and RHAs to undertake Investigations identified in 24 above, as described in the CHHMS. Oversight to be provided by SAC.	Complete. No longer relevant.
4	Multi-stakeholder Management: AHW in partnership with CASA to establish a multi-stakeholder management group that will function as an Operations Steering Committee as described in the CHHMS. This is distinct from the data management required to operate the system.	Complete. No longer relevant.
5	Feedback: New information will continuously feedback into on-going activity. AHW should coordinate feedback as part of the CHHMS.	Complete. No longer relevant.

Recommendations 1-5

- Merry provided some rationale on behalf of the team as to why these recommendations are no longer relevant.
- In summary, the concept that was imagined as a result of implementation of the CHHMS would be the ability to show linkages between air quality and health effects. As systems have evolved over the last number of years, this concept is now being realized through larger government driven initiatives or strategies like the Integrated Resource Management System (IRMS), Alberta Environmental Monitoring, Evaluation, and Reporting Agency (AEMERA), and the Open Data Portal. The GoA system is a continually evolving initiative and the

concept of linkages between air quality and health is being integrated into all streams of policy development, implementation, evaluation and management.

- Some changes were suggested to the original document drafted by Merry. With these changes, the team accepted the document as their own.

The team agreed by consensus that recommendations #1 to 5 can be deemed complete, as they are no longer relevant and that they would provide this determination and the underlying rationale to the Board.

Action Item 22.1: Merry to provide website addresses for the GoA Open Data Portal, Alberta Health Interactive Health Data Application, Air Quality Health Index (Technical Map), and the Air Quality Health Index.

The team discussed the status of the remaining recommendations. Please see the table below.

Ref. #	Recommendation	Status
	Animal Health Project Team – Final Report and Recommendations (March 2003)	
6	Recommendation 2 The AHPT recommends that the proposed complaints/response line, which is part of the approved Human Health Monitoring System, be expanded to enable documentation of and response to animal health complaints related to air pollution.	Incomplete. The HAHT advises that the Board review this recommendation to determine if further work is required. The team feels that they can not make a determination about this recommendation as current team membership includes only one animal health representative, Alberta Agriculture and Rural Development. Since the full range of animal health interests are not represented the team can not make a decision about this recommendation. This recommendation was developed on basis that the Comprehensive Human Health Monitoring System (CHHMS) would be implemented. The CHHMS has not been implemented as originally imagined, making it difficult to integrate animal health into the system. However, the team has concerns that deeming this recommendation “not applicable” could result in animal health concerns being overlooked in the future.
	Human and Animal Health Project Team – Final Report to CASA Board (August 2007)	
7	Recommendation 1 (consensus) The Human and Animal Health Team recommends that the CASA Board of Directors disband the team.	The team advices that the Board “revive” and accept this recommendation and disband the team.
8	Recommendation 2 (non-consensus) Alberta Health and Wellness, working with Alberta Energy and Utilities Board, Alberta Environment and the Regional Health Authorities implement the Environmental Health Hotline of the Comprehensive Human Health Monitoring System.	

Ref. #	Recommendation	Status
	Complete. No longer relevant. At the March 2008 Board meeting, there was consensus to remove this recommendation.	
9	Recommendation 3 (non-consensus) Alberta Health and Wellness, working with other regulators, non-governmental organizations and industry, establish a multi-stakeholder advisory committee to the Comprehensive Human Health Monitoring System.	
	Complete. No longer relevant.	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Larger government initiatives as those described above, use a variety of multi-stakeholder management groups to implement or inform part of the work. • CASA specific initiatives include odour management, electricity and non-point sources which all have linkages back to larger government initiatives or strategies. 	
10	CASA Board Meeting (March 2008) Recommendation 1 The Syndromic Surveillance Network as a means of implementing the Comprehensive Human Health Monitoring System. Therefore, the team withdraws the Non-Consensus Recommendation 1 on the 1-800 number and the Consensus Recommendation 1 to disband the team.	
	Complete.	
	Alberta Health implemented the Alberta Real Time Syndromic Surveillance Network (ARTSSN).	
11	Recommendation 2 The team recommends that Alberta Health and Wellness report to the CASA Board on the implementation of the Syndromic Surveillance Network for the purpose of enhanced environmental health surveillance by June 2009.	
	Complete.	
	In December 2011, Alberta Health presented to the Board on the implementation of ARTSSN and the Board decided that ARTSSN did not fulfill the intent of CHHMS as was originally expected.	
12	Low-Rated Recommendations sent to HAHT by the Performance Measures Committee (2012) From the Flaring and Venting Team (1998) The Energy and Utilities Board, Alberta Environmental Protection, Alberta Health and Alberta Agriculture, Food and Rural Development establish processes and linkages to relate data on oil and gas wells, and solution gas flaring and venting with data on pollutants, environmental receptors, and human and animal health.	
	Complete. No longer relevant.	
	Since the recommendation was made 15 years ago, it seems redundant, as the context and the tools available have significantly changed. However, the processes and linkages described in the recommendation are realized through larger government driven initiatives or strategies like the Integrated Resource Management System (IRMS), Alberta Environmental Monitoring Reporting Agency	

Ref. #	Recommendation	Status
	<p>(AEMRA), and the Open Data Portal. In addition, the Interactive Health App is able to load data by disease and geographic location. This concept of demonstrating linkages between exposure and health effects is a continually evolving initiative and is being integrated into all streams of policy development, implementation, evaluation and management.</p> <p>The HAHT recognizes that, as they did under #6, they do not have the appropriate representation to make a determination about animal health. The team advises that project managers consider how to incorporate concerns about animal health into existing and future teams.</p>	
13	<p>From the Data Issues Group (2003)</p> <p>Approve and implement the human health monitoring framework (tool for detecting trends and associations between air quality and health-related variables).</p> <p>Complete. No longer relevant.</p> <p>Since the recommendation was made 10 years ago, it seems redundant, as the context and the tools available have significantly changed. However, the tools for detecting trends and associations described in the recommendation are realized through larger government driven initiatives or strategies like the Integrated Resource Management System (IRMS), Alberta Environmental Monitoring Reporting Agency (AEMRA), and the Open Data Portal. This concept of demonstrating trends and associations between air quality and health-related variables is a continually evolving initiative and is being integrated into all streams of policy development, implementation, evaluation and management.</p>	

3) Recommendation to Disband the Team

The team agreed by consensus to “revive” Recommendation 1 from the 2007 HAHT report. This recommendation states:

The Human and Animal Health Team recommends that the CASA Board of Directors disband the team.

4) Presentation to the Board

Ruth volunteered to present to the Board on the team’s behalf at the December 12 Board meeting. The team discussed some of the following messages:

- We know the system is not perfect yet, but progress is being made and GoA is working towards the coordination function that was originally envisioned by the CHHMS. There needs to be this fluidity to the system to allow adjustments to changing context and needs.
- Linking air data to health data is still under development. Science and analysis is an evolving piece.
- Include the advice that was developed in Meeting #21.

5) Next Steps

- Michelle will prepare a decision sheet for the Board book, to be approved by the co-chairs.
- Michelle will prepare a summary report, including the status of the recommendations. The team suggested that they only need a 1 to 2 day turnaround to approve this document.
- Michelle will work with Ruth to finalize the presentation for the Board.

Action Item 22.2: The secretariat will update 2007 report to reflect the discussions of the March 2008 Board meeting.